

Proof-Reading Exercise: Summaries, Quotations, & Paraphrasing in Essays on the Commodification of Leisure

The purpose of this exercise is to improve student's proof reading and sensitivity to discrete criteria that is used to determine the quality of composition and scholarly use of quotations and paraphrasing.

Directions: Read each essay and use the rubric to assess the quality of each. When you have completed all three assessments, determine which essay was the best and be prepared to explain why.

[Based on: Wearing, B. and Wearing S. (1992). Identity and the Commodification of Leisure. *Leisure Studies*, 11 (3-18).

Sample A

Wearing and Wearing (1992) assert that the commodification of leisure has had a profound impact on how individuals make choices about leisure activities and how they engage in them. They have also argued that commodification of leisure adversely influences the individual's sense of self and tends to reinforce backwards stereotypes about gender and class. The authors claim that commercial realm of leisure is characterized by marketing goods related to sport and recreation for profit rather than for public well-being, infusing the act of leisure with material and technical outcomes, and marginalization of the introspective and aesthetic aspects of leisure. To overcome the negative impact of commercialization, the authors suggest that public policies related to leisure strive to ensure the accessibility of recreational resources to all people, and invite people to create recreational programs that prompt individuals to think about their lives and explore their sense of self in meaningful ways.

The thesis of this essay is grounded in the theory that leisure represents free time in which individuals determine their activities. Ideally, leisure represents a form of sacred space in which individuals experience a break from the demands of routines and obligations, and in which they are able to refresh their sense of self and engage in activities which restore their sense of being connected to the natural world and to life in deeply meaningful ways. The authors assert that when leisure is commodified, external agencies, such as corporations and ad agencies, impose their definition of what is meaningful activity, and then impose their idea about how activities ought to be properly engaged. In one example, they note that commodification shifts the focus on the runner who runs for revitalization to a runner who is preoccupied with timing, wearing the "right" outfit, being fitted with the most technically advanced shoes, and measuring one's vital signs while in motion. A non-commodified activity does not impose ridiculous rewards such as those that might come in beating another runner time in a marathon. Authors point to rock-climbing as an example of recreation that may be personally challenging and may bring people closer to nature without necessarily investing in expensive equipment and exclusive access to certain places. To paraphrase the authors, it is possible for leisure to give people non-commercial ways of developing their sense of identity and sense of self.

Authors note that commodified experience is one that immerses people in the same anxieties found in one's work and domestic routines, which are largely concerned largely with meeting unreasonable expectations and focusing on matters other than one's identity and meaning. Wearing

and Wearing acknowledge that, “the way people recreate is strongly influenced by the groups to which they belong, such as families, associations, communities and nations,” and that norms about how people recreate in certain groups can reinforce stereotypes about gender, age, and class and so limit one’s perception of self rather liberate it. Authors note, for example, that motherhood is a significant role that defines many identities, and since it is associated with domestic activities, those women who participate in recreation outside the home and in activities traditionally associated with masculinity, often find themselves at odds with the dominant social discourse on what it means to be a mother.

The authors assert that leisure providers should take responsibility for creating opportunities for people to participate in recreational activities that are not by nature restrictive to people of a certain class, age, or gender. They encourage providers to enrich recreational activities, such as those directed toward youth development and intervention, to include formative aspects that facilitate participant’s reflection on themselves and others. The authors also encourage providers to be mindful about the limiting effects of cost and its capacity to reinforce beliefs about which class of people should have the privilege of participating in which sorts of recreation.

Rubric for grading a summary with paraphrasing: 40 points possible.

Criteria	Poor (2)	Sufficient (3)	Good (4)	Outstanding (5)
Clarity	Ideas were vague and confusing; it was difficult to separate the authors’ voice from the student’s; poor use of words; very disorganized	Some ideas were clear, some vague; it was usually easy to separate the authors’ voice from the student’s; marginally acceptable use of words; largely organized	Most ideas were clear; it was easy to separate the authors’ voice from the student’s; minor problems with word choice; acceptable use of words; well-organized	All ideas were very clear and it was easy to separate the authors’ voice from the student’s; excellent word choice; very well organized
Depth	Summary misses point or focuses only on one idea with little to no development and understanding of the significance of the work	Summary addresses multiple points but development of ideas is emerging and reflects adequate understanding of significance of ideas	Summary discusses many points and explores the author’s examples with appropriate attention to detail and understanding of the significance of the work	Summary discusses all key points and explores the author’s examples with abundant attention to detail and understanding of the significance of the work with original insight
Accuracy	Many errors in representing the author’s ideas; multiple misunderstandings; no grasp of implications	Some minor misrepresentation of author’s ideas; reported main points accurately; some implications noted	Only one or two minor points of confusion; some implications are explored well	No errors in representing author’s work or the implications of the author’s work
Evidence	Offers no or wrong evidence or example to support assertions about the author’s work	Offers adequate evidence and examples to support claims about the essay	Offers much evidence and many examples to support claims about essay with emerging original synthesis and insight	Offers robust evidence and examples to support claims about essay with outstanding original synthesis and insight
Objectivity	Lacks objective voice, often judges authors; unfair claims and multiple assumptions made; biases is clear	Emerging objective voice, some judgment and assumptions evident; bias frequently conveyed in word use	Good objective voice, largely non-judgmental; some assumptions and very few if any biases in word choice	Exemplary objectivity; lacking in judgment and superb use of non-biased language
Concise	Exceeds appropriate limit; is very wordy and repetitive; poor topic sentences	Summary is sufficient in length, but somewhat wordy and repetitive; inconsistent quality of topic sentence	Summary is concise and avoids repetition; generally well-constructed topic sentences	Outstanding summary; avoids repetition; precise topic sentences

Quoting and Paraphrasing	Fails to paraphrase or quote; plagiarizes; does not capture essence of author's ideas	Demonstrates some paraphrasing and quoting but lacks proper cue and/or citation; fair representation of author's ideas	Use multiple paraphrasing and quotation; inconsistent cues and citations; good representation of author's ideas when paraphrasing	Excellent and multiple paraphrasing and quotation; very clear and consistent cues and citations; precise representation of author's ideas
Grammar	Lacks mastery of punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Emerging mastery; multiple errors in word use, punctuation, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Very few errors in punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Near perfect use of punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives

Your grade: _____ (Use rubric to render score: 40-36=A; 35-32=B; 31-28=C; 27-24=D...)

Your rationale for the grade:

Sample B

Wearing and Wearing (1992) think that the commodification of leisure destroys the impact on how individuals make choices about leisure activities and how they get into them. They start by telling us that leisure is important for identities because we don't get to work on identities while we are one the job. The authors say that commercialized leisure is about getting lots of profit and not how we really see ourselves and how we really feel about our lives. They say that sometimes marketing is stereotyping because it tells us that only rich people can do certain things and that only guys can do certain things, etc. They say that this is not fair and that people who give leisure to the public should be more responsible. Stereotyping should not exist. Corporations should not tell people what kind of recreation is good for them. If girls want to play hockey, then they should and if mothers want to go surfing they should and if boys want to take up knitting its ok—its all about how to get people to live in meaningful ways.

The thesis of this essay is that leisure is free time where people get to do what they want. The idea of leisure is that it is not work. It is where you get to do what you want and nobody can tell you what is good for you to do. Some people like leisure in nature and that is ok for them but it might not be ok with somebody else and that is up to them. When advertising push people into doing things they don't want to do it's a bad thing. The authors criticize certain attitudes about leisure. They think the kinds that make people do things just because they are women or just because they are old is unfair. They would like to see people change this attitude but they do not say how. This is a certain kind of thing the authors should tell you about if they are going to argue that commodities in leisure are bad for you. They say that leisure is to construct an identity and it is unfair that corporations think they should be able to construct that for you. Just because you like a certain sport of hobby doesn't mean you are a certain way. Its up to us to find the right recreation that makes us feel like we are who we are. It would be nice, according to the writers, if people would make an effort to supply society with recreation that everyone could enjoy. This doesn't mean that everyone has the same amount of time for leisure and this is a weakness. Everyone needs to have the time and opportunity of non-commercial ways of developing personally their sense of identity and sense of self.

Authors note that commodified experiences are like work experiences one's work and are dull and excruciating routines. Domestic routines are the most limiting routines, especially for women who are mothers. These people can't get out of the house without being judged. Women can't figure out who they are if they can't get out of the house. If women see themselves only as mothers, they will only have recreation with their kids. If the mother is poor this is double trouble because then for sure nobody is going to do what rich people do like go to Tahoe and ski or take a cruise on a ship. Authors say that motherhood has to do with identity but they don't say anything about guys. The gender issue is an issue that commercials hit hard and by showing pictures of mothers on reality shows or the movies they can tell you how to be a mother and what it means to be a mother.

The authors assert that leisure providers should provide leisure for everyone. They say by not providing leisure for everyone that it sends the idea that stereotyping is OK. They say that everyone deserve to think about themselves and to be in nature and to feel good about themselves for who they are. When people tell you that you can't do a sport or hobby because you don't have the right clothes or the most expensive equipment, they are commodifying. The authors are challenging our society's ideas about who has the right to do what they want to do and who has the right to participating in which sorts of recreation.

Rubric for grading a summary with paraphrasing: 40 points possible.

Criteria	Poor (2)	Sufficient (3)	Good (4)	Outstanding (5)
Clarity	Ideas were vague and confusing; it was difficult to separate the authors' voice from the student's; poor use of words; very disorganized	Some ideas were clear, some vague; it was usually easy to separate the authors' voice from the student's; marginally acceptable use of words; largely organized	Most ideas were clear; it was easy to separate the authors' voice from the student's; minor problems with word choice; acceptable use of words; well-organized	All ideas were very clear and it was easy to separate the authors' voice from the student's; excellent word choice; very well organized
Depth	Summary misses point or focuses only on one idea with little to no development and understanding of the significance of the work	Summary addresses multiple points but development of ideas is emerging and reflects adequate understanding of significance of ideas	Summary discusses many points and explores the author's examples with appropriate attention to detail and understanding of the significance of the work	Summary discusses all key points and explores the author's examples with abundant attention to detail and understanding of the significance of the work with original insight
Accuracy	Many errors in representing the author's ideas; multiple misunderstandings; no grasp of implications	Some minor misrepresentation of author's ideas; reported main points accurately; some implications noted	Only one or two minor points of confusion; some implications are explored well	No errors in representing author's work or the implications of the author's work
Evidence	Offers no or wrong evidence or example to support assertions about the author's work	Offers adequate evidence and examples to support claims about the essay	Offers much evidence and many examples to support claims about essay with emerging original synthesis and insight	Offers robust evidence and examples to support claims about essay with outstanding original synthesis and insight
Objectivity	Lacks objective voice, often judges authors; unfair claims and multiple assumptions made; biases is clear	Emerging objective voice, some judgment and assumptions evident; bias frequently conveyed in word use	Good objective voice, largely non-judgmental; some assumptions and very few if any biases in word choice	Exemplary objectivity; lacking in judgment and superb use of non-biased language

Concise	Summary far exceeds appropriate limit; very wordy and repetitive; poor topic sentences	Summary is sufficient in length, but somewhat wordy and repetitive; inconsistent quality of topic sentence	Summary is concise and avoids repetition; generally well-constructed topic sentences	Outstanding summary; avoids repetition; precise topic sentences
Quoting and Paraphrasing	Fails to paraphrase or quote; plagiarizes; does not capture essence of author's ideas	Demonstrates some paraphrasing and quoting but lacks proper cue and/or citation; fair representation of author's ideas	Use multiple paraphrasing and quotation; inconsistent cues and citations; good representation of author's ideas when paraphrasing	Excellent and multiple paraphrasing and quotation; very clear and consistent cues and citations; precise representation of author's ideas
Grammar	Lacks mastery of punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Emerging mastery; multiple errors in word use, punctuation, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Very few errors in punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Near perfect use of punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives

Your grade: _____ (Use rubric to render score: 40-36=A; 35-32=B; 31-28=C; 27-24=D...)

Your rationale for the grade:

Sample C

Wearing and Wearing (1992) assert that the commodification of leisure has an adverse effect on the choices individuals make about leisure activities and how they perceive their purpose and meaning. The authors define leisure time as special time that is not only a relief from commodified time—or time that is spent earning a living or performing tasks necessary for material survival, and as time that offers individuals a source of excitement, the opportunity to deepen their own sense of self, and the occasion to experience personal connections with nature. According to the authors, leisure that has been commodified and mass-marketed loses its capacity to nourish one's sense of self and connection with nature. They assert that when the experience of activities do not measure up to the advertised sensation people would receive when participating in them, the leisure time is neither free nor self-enhancing, "but a form of escapism from equal units of unending sameness that make up commodified time" (Wearing and Wearing, p. 6). The authors also assert that commodification of leisure often reinforces stereotypes, perpetuates practices that restrict access to certain experiences, and fail to facilitate self-exploration in meaningful ways.

The thesis of this essay is grounded in the notion that when recreation is designed to generate profit, it often exploits people's need to belong to groups and to have their identities affirmed by others. In commodifying leisure and recreation, providers often reinforce stereotypes about gender, age, and class, and so do not create opportunities for individuals to freely explore themselves, but instead restrict conceptions of identity. Authors note, for example, that motherhood is a significant role that defines many identities, and since it is associated with domestic activities, women who participate in recreation outside the home and in activities traditionally associated with masculinity, risk alienating themselves from other women who have very different ideas about what it means to be a woman and mother. The exploitation of people's anxieties about their identities is visible in the appeal to status as Wearing and Wearing note for example, that when commodified, the purpose of running becomes less connected to

the individuals experience of the activity and more connected to whether the runner wore the right clothing, the best shoes, the distance covered, and the calories consumed. In addition, the commodification of running transforms the experience from one that arouses anxieties about whether one has the right kind of equipment and goals for running rather than an experience that focuses the individual's attention on his or her body and sense of self.

Authors note that leisure and recreation can “create a space for resistance to dominant discourses,” and as such help to liberate people from culturally normed behavior that does little to relieve people from anxieties associated with performing to meet other people's expectations. They assert that, “The commercialization of leisure merely temps the individual to more and more consumerism in an attempt to find the romance of self-fulfillment without necessarily solving the real needs of people” (Wearing and Wearing, p. 14). The implication is clear: the real needs of people are not necessarily met by commodification of leisure. The authors indicate that the penultimate result of the commodification of leisure is that people lose an aesthetic sense of purpose.

The authors assert that by de-commodifying leisure and recreation, participants may more readily direct their attention to psychological and aesthetic experiences that may not only be more satisfying than keeping up with what the market demands, but be more supportive of thinking that can lead to personal and community improvement. The authors state that providers of leisurely and recreational outlets should take responsibility for creating opportunities for people to participate in recreational activities that are not by nature restrictive to people of a certain class, age, or gender, and to be mindful about the limiting effects of cost and its capacity to reinforce beliefs about which class of people should have the privilege of participating in which sorts of recreation.

Rubric for grading a summary with paraphrasing: 40 points possible.

Criteria	Poor (2)	Sufficient (3)	Good (4)	Outstanding (5)
Clarity	Ideas were vague and confusing; it was difficult to separate the authors' voice from the student's; poor use of words; very disorganized	some ideas were clear, some vague; it was usually easy to separate the authors' voice from the student's; marginally acceptable use of words; largely organized	Most ideas were clear; it was easy to separate the authors' voice from the student's; minor problems with word choice; acceptable use of words; well-organized	All ideas were very clear and it was easy to separate the authors' voice from the student's; excellent word choice; very well organized
Depth	Summary misses point or focuses only on one idea with little to no development and understanding of the significance of the work	Summary addresses multiple points but development of ideas is emerging and reflects adequate understanding of significance of ideas	Summary discusses many points and explores the author's examples with appropriate attention to detail and understanding of the significance of the work	Summary discusses all key points and explores the author's examples with abundant attention to detail and understanding of the significance of the work with original insight
Accuracy	Many errors in representing the author's ideas; multiple misunderstandings; no grasp of implications	Some minor misrepresentation of author's ideas; reported main points accurately; some implications noted	Only one or two minor points of confusion; some implications are explored well	No errors in representing author's work or the implications of the author's work
Evidence	Offers no or wrong evidence or example to support assertions about the author's work	Offers adequate evidence and examples to support claims about the essay	Offers much evidence and many examples to support claims about essay with emerging original synthesis and insight	Offers robust evidence and examples to support claims about essay with outstanding original synthesis and insight

Objectivity	Lacks objective voice, often judges authors; unfair claims and multiple assumptions made; biases is clear	Emerging objective voice, some judgment and assumptions evident; bias frequently conveyed in word use	Good objective voice, largely non-judgmental; some assumptions and very few if any biases in word choice	Exemplary objectivity; lacking in judgment and superb use of non-biased language
Concise	Exceeds appropriate limit; is very wordy and repetitive; poor topic sentences	Summary is sufficient in length, but somewhat wordy and repetitive; inconsistent quality of topic sentence	Summary is concise and avoids repetition; generally well-constructed topic sentences	Outstanding summary; avoids repetition; precise topic sentences
Quoting and Paraphrasing	Fails to paraphrase or quote; plagiarizes; does not capture essence of author's ideas	Demonstrates some paraphrasing and quoting but lacks proper cue and/or citation; fair representation of author's ideas	Use multiple paraphrasing and quotation; inconsistent cues and citations; good representation of author's ideas when paraphrasing	Excellent and multiple paraphrasing and quotation; very clear and consistent cues and citations; precise representation of author's ideas
Grammar	Lacks mastery of punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Emerging mastery; multiple errors in word use, punctuation, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Very few errors in punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives	Near perfect use of punctuation, word use, sentence structure, and rules concerning verbs, nouns, adverbs, and adjectives

Your grade: _____ (Use rubric to render score: 40-36=A; 35-32=B; 31-28=C; 27-24=D...)

Your rationale for the grade:

Which is the best essay and why?
